73. Investigating adaptation shifts: Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland vs. Alice: Madness Returns

Tules ÖNENÇ


Abstract

This study aims to investigate the changes that occurred between Lewis Carroll’s canonical novel Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland and its adapted video game version, Alice: Madness Returns by treating adaptation as a form of intersemiotic and functional translation (Gottlieb, 2005). In order to conduct the analysis, the interdisciplinary model of adaptation shifts proposed by Perdikaki(2017a) is used. This model is chosen because it is the first one to offer a systematic analysis of changes that occur in adaptations. Although the model was developed for film adaptations, Perdikaki(2017a) proposes the application of this model to different genres and adaptation types. In line with her suggestion, this study applies the model of adaptation shifts to the above-mentioned video game, by treating it as an audiovisual product and a multimedium text. The analysis is conducted with a special emphasis on the descriptive component of this model where shifts can be observed since this category investigates the factors that are independent of the text type. As a result, it is concluded that adaptation shifts are observable on the descriptive level such as the plot structure, narrative techniques, characterization, and setting and that these shifts are observable through modifications and modulations; molding the adapted videogame version of the original work. This study also sets out to be one of the initial studies that show the applicability of this model to a different genre and adapted text type.

Keywords: adaptation studies, intersemiotic translation, adaptation shifts, Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland, Alice: Madness Returns

Adaptasyon kayımları üzerine karşılaştırılmış bir çalışma: Alice Harikalar Diyarında romanı ve Alice: Madness Returns video oyunu

Öz

gözlemlenebildiği faktörleri dikkate alan betimleyici kategorisine odaklanmıştır. Sonuç olarak, olay örgüsü yapısı, anlatım teknikleri, karakterizasyon ve mekan gibi betimsel düzeyde uyarlama kayımlarının gözlemlenebilir olduğu ve bu kayımların modifikasyon ve modülasyonlar yoluyla ortaya çıktığı ve bunlara birlikte uyarlanan ürünün, kaynak metin ile birlikte yeniden şekillendirildiği görülmüştür. Bu çalışma aynı zamanda uyarlama kayımları modellinin farklı metin türlerinin yansıısı, uyarlanmış metin türlerine de uygulanabilirliğini gösteren ilk çalışmalardan biri olma özelliğini taşımaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: uyarlama çalışmaları, video oyun uyarlamaları, göstergeler arası çeviri, uyarlama kayımları, Alice Harikalar Diyarında, Alice: Madness Returns

1. Introduction

Translation Studies have evolved into a multidisciplinary subject of study and practice. Originally, translation was thought to be the conveyance of an oral meaning that included many forms and actions of representation and intercultural interchange. The meaning-making procedure in translation was assumed to be influenced by a range of sources, ranging from oral, verbal, and audio-visual forms. As a result, recent advances in translation research have focused on models capable of assessing, such as intersemiotic and multimodal (Perdikaki, 2017a). As Tymozcko (2007) suggests in her seminal book Enlarging Translation, the interdisciplinarity of translation studies is much needed and it has begun to evolve. Adaptation Studies, in this sense, are considered a promising area that can benefit both studies. The term “adaptation” may be used to explain the alterations that occur throughout the translation processes. Since translation products can take many forms, the usual discussions generally focus on the differences between translation and adaptation. For example, adaptations have been used to describe the translation process of audio-visual (Díaz-Cintas and Remael 2007) specifically focusing on time and space constraints in the workplace, as well as the translation of ads due to cross-cultural encounters. The term adaptation is used by different scholars who utilize it as functional translation. Also, it has been used to describe the translational approach used to provide cultural allusions that the target audience does not understand (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958/1995); similar usage of the term may be found in audio-visual translation. Milton, for instance, states that all of the studies which tackled adaptations emphasize the cross-linguistic element of translating from one language to another. But he also states that the translations they deal with can also be intersemiotic, adapting works from one code to another, for example "from page to stage", from novel to film or play (2010, pg.3). A more recent example of this can be presented from video-game adaptations. Videogame adaptation has been defined as a different narrative form by Planagan (2017) as they present a plausible connection for adaptation studies since it’s more dynamic and interactive and they have the latest power to make and remake stories. After a few unsuccessful initiatives of adapting movies to video games such as ET (1983) and Death Race (1976), especially after 2015, videogame adaptations began to be much more successful and popular (Stobbart, 2018, pg.1). Furthermore, videogame adaptations have seemed to be more preferred by the audience to a point that film adaptations of videogames have begun to be produced and consumed by the audience with great contentment such as Lara Croft: Tomb Raider (2001). Especially, the consecutive video games that follow films and novelizations helped these products to become a common form (ibid.).

The present study will focus on such an example; namely the video game adapted version of Lewis Carroll’s Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland; American McGee’s Alice and its follow-up Alice: Madness Returns (McGee 2011). This particular video game has been chosen because although these games are a

Adres
RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmalar Dergisi
Osmanağa Mahallesi, Mürver Çiçeği Sokak, No:14/8
Kadıköy - İSTANBUL / TÜRKİYE 34714
e-posta: editor@rumelide.com
tel: +90 505 7998124, +90 216 773 0 616

Address
RumeliDE Journal of Language and Literature Studies
Osmanağa Mahallesi, Mürver Çiçeği Sokak, No:14/8
Kadıköy - İSTANBUL / TURKEY 34714
e-mail: editor@rumelide.com,
phone: +90 505 7998124, +90 216 773 0 616
continuation of the narratives of Carroll’s novels, they combine much of the original material from the novels to create a new, dark and raw adult version of Alice. This adaptation rewrites the narratives of Carroll’s stories, using cultural references and different approaches to construct its narrative by adding puzzle-solving and combating parts that actively transport the player into Wonderland as an active participant of the game. So, it can be said that this work reinterprets and adapts Alice de Carroll’s novels and it also turns traditional children’s stories into a twisted, mature story that forces the player to rethink their knowledge of the original texts (Stobbart, 2018, pg.5-6). For this study, the concept of adaptation will be taken as a form of intersemiotic translation as Gottlieb (2005) suggests. As the descriptive tool, the analysis model of Perdikaki (2017a) will be used which can be considered as an initiative to systematically evaluate the shifts that occur in film adaptations and translations. Although this model was developed for film adaptations and several studies have been conducted with a small corpus (see Perdikaki, 2016; 2017a; 2017b; 2018; Akseki, 2018), Perdikaki suggests the application of this model to different genres and adaptation types to see the applicability of the model into a broader corpus (2017a, pg.20). Drawing upon the above-mentioned information, this study aims to investigate the adaptation shifts that occurred in the transfer of a canonical literary text; *Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland*, into a twisted videogame *Alice: Madness Returns*, treating adaptation as an intersemiotic and functional translation thus applying an interdisciplinary approach combining translation studies, adaptation studies and from a brief perspective, ludology. Following the introduction, the next section will present information regarding some common grounds between translation and adaptation studies and it will provide information regarding Perdikaki’s (2017a) evaluative adaptation shift model. After the theoretical background, the adaptation shifts will be examined in the following section.

2. Theoretical background

2.1. Adaptation and translation: some common grounds

As an interdisciplinary subject of research and practice, translation studies have evolved enormously. Initially, translation was thought to be the transmission of a given meaning, embracing many forms and actions of representation as well as intercultural contact. The intentionality of the translation process was seen to be dependent on various sources, such as spoken, written, and audio-visual forms. Accordingly, recent breakthroughs in Translation Studies have moved its focus to models capable of analyzing these meaningful and multimodal texts (Desilla 2012; Dicerto 2015; Littau 2011; Pérez-González 2014 cf. Perdikaki, 2017a, pg.2). In line with this, the concept of adaptation was adopted to characterize the changes that occurred throughout the translation process. Because of the multitude of formats that translation products might take, a recurring issue of conflict between translation and adaptation is considered to be present. For instance, adaptation has been used to refer to the audiovisual translation process owing to workplace space-time constraints (Diaz-Cintas and Remael 2007 cf. Perdikaki, 2017a pg.2) and translation of advertising texts (or transcreation) due to multicultural concerns (Valdés 2011 cf. ibid.). Perdikaki (2017a, pg.2) suggests that the analogy between ‘translation as adaptation’ has been adopted to analyze the “changes made in translation to meet the demands and expectations of the target audience and culture”. ‘Adaptation as translation’, on the other hand, has been used to indicate the “changes made to literary works adapted for the screen or stage in a similar field, adaptation studies”.

Related to the above information, Cattryse (2014) in his book *Descriptive Adaptation Studies* (inspired by Toury’s Descriptive Translation Studies) focuses on the issue of some common grounds that translation studies and adaptation studies share and suggests that each of these areas can benefit from
each other immensely and contribute to their field of study as means of interdisciplinarity. Similarly, Venuti (2007, pg.28) draws attention to the similarities between the two fields and emphasizes that the resemblance between translation and adaptation is many times addressed in the literature but without any details. Drawing upon the similarities between translation studies and adaptation studies, Cattrysse (2014, pg.47-48) presents and identifies some common points between these fields as follows:

1. Both adaptation and translation entail products that are produced by humans, therefore they entail a complex context, involved different agents having different agendas,

2. Both processes include articulated products or texts. He also claims that adaptation and translation production processes are intra- or intertextual in the first order and intra- or inter-semiotic in the second order. He defines intra- or inter-textual quality as a user’s engagement with texts in a given context, as well as the mental, psychological, and physical impacts that come from this connection,

3. Translation and adaptation are seen as irreversible processes, in the sense that a back-translation is not the same as the source text, and a novelization of a cinema adaptation is not the same as the original novel; based on Toury’s (1980, pg.24) idea of translations being unidirectional,

4. Source and target context conditioners would influence adaptation and translation processes, albeit the latter has a significant role in overall decision-making,

5. 'Equivalence' concepts might be found in both adaptation and translation (cf. Perdikaki, 2017a, pg.3).

An exception can be presented here about the unidirectionality of adaptations. Stobbart claims that the relationship between the videogames and printed media is not unidirectional (2018, pg.8) because there are many successful adaptations of various videogames that have been novelized and merchandized to different mediums and products. She presents the example of Assassin’s Creed 2 (Ubisoft Games, 2007-present); how it has been adapted to novels, and how these novels became subsequent games of their own. So, in this case, the adaption does not “replace, or even imitate, the gameplay, but rather incorporates novelization to enrich the narrative with literary and filmic traditions” (Stobbart, 2018, pg.9). Similar to Stobbart, Hutcheon (2013, pg. 173) states that adaptations modify the original work and insert different meanings into it, and their success is dependent on their ability to survive independently for both audiences who are familiar or unfamiliar with the original work. Also, she defines the core of adaptation as “the ability to repeat without duplicating, to integrate difference in repetition”.

Focusing on adaptation and translation being intersemiotic concepts, Gottlieb classifies not specifically videogame translations, but screen adaptations under the category of intersemiotic translation and defines it as “working with large amounts of freedom” and as “in which a monosemiotic work like a novel is usually semiotically ‘unzipped’ and it recreates the polysemiotic structure of the dramatic work” (Gottlieb, 2005, pg.8). The core of these discussions can be traced back to Jakobson (1959, pg.233) and his definitions of translation types where he defines three distinct types intralingual, interlingual, and intersemiotic where the first term refers to the “interpretation of verbal signs into other signs of the same language”. The second is referred to as the “translation proper and it stands for the “interpretation of verbal signs into other languages””. The third concept, intersemiotic translation is defined as “transmutation – as a form of interpretation of verbal signs into non-verbal sign systems or symbols” which can be interpreted into videogame adaptation as an intersemiotic translation in which verbal signs (in this case the novel) is transferred into (non)verbal sign system (the video-game), in this case. In addition, intersemiotic translation can be considered an adaptation because the source text is converted to adapt into a new form that has its own time and place constraints (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2007). Perdikaki (2017a, pg.2) tackles this issue in detail, concentrating on the similar usages of adaptation and translation. She states that the analogy between ‘translation as adaptation’ is used to evaluate the changes that occur in translations to answer the needs of target readers or audiences and their culture.
The usage of ‘adaptation as translation’ refers to a more general sense, especially in Adaptation Studies to address the modifications that have been employed to literary pieces which are transferred to the screen or stage. Hence, videogame adaptations can be considered complicated mediums since it has a multidimensional nature that involves filmic features and is formed by subjective interpretations. In other words, videogame adaptation aims to make texts from one genre in one medium playable in another genre in another medium. So, when an asset is translated from a fixed narrative media form, such as a novel or a film, game designers are obliged to do more than simply relocate the story material, characters, and visual description approximations. All of the experience frameworks as a whole may be adjusted (Flannagan, 2017, pg. 443). It can be said that this situation creates a broad space for shifts that can occur while transferring one product in a genre into another medium. Bastin identifies shifts as objective interventions (2012, pg. 76), and explains that they can be both text and context-based (Molina & Hurtado Albir 498-512 cf. ibid.). These shifts can show changes in the lexicon, structure, or meaning between the source and target texts (Gagnon, 201-23 cf. ibid.) and he states that these changes can be considered obligatory ones since most of the time both translators and adaptors do not have a choice (ibid.). Venuti (2007) called for focusing on shifts while evaluating an adaptation by indicating the need “to focus on shifts, deletions, additions, and substitutions that become visible in the adaptation when it is contrasted to the original material” (pg. 33).

2.2. Perdikaki’s model of adaptation shifts

Drawing upon these callings and different studies from the research areas of Translation Studies, Adaptation Studies, and Narratology, Perdikaki suggests an analysis of shifts in adaptations. She uses Leuven-Zwart’s (1989) model of translational shifts—using its components of modulation, mutation, and modification—and it combines it with concepts from narratology which implies the existence of narrative elements in visual and verbal components. The model is intended to be a methodological instrument for conducting a systematic investigation of adaptation as intersemiotic translation, and it has the potential to be applied to other examples of adaptation (Perdikaki, 2017a, pg. 10). She states that the shifts in adaptations can be both obligatory and optional. According to Perdikaki (2017a), alterations between books and films (i.e. adaptation shifts) may be required owing to inherent differences between books and movies as coding systems, or they may be voluntary according to the adapter’s style and uniqueness. In these words, she describes optional adaptation shifts as the choices made by the adaptor to portray the original material utilizing the meaning-making tools provided by the cinematic code (pg. 6). As a result, for her, adaptation, like translation, necessitates “translation subjectivity” (Loffredo and Perteghella 2006, p. 2 cf. ibid.) since it represents the adapter’s view and response to the source material. This methodological tool has two subcategories namely descriptive and interpretive but for the aims and purposes of this study, the interpretive aspect will not be taken into consideration. The first component consists of four subcategories which are plot structure, narrative techniques, characterization, and setting—depending on time and space constraints (Akseki, 2018, pg. 4). Plot structure, in her own words, refers to the “story itself and its fictional events” (Perdikaki, 2017a, pg. 11). Narrative techniques, on the other hand, are related to how these “fictional events are communicated with the readers or audiences” (ibid.). Characterization refers to how the character is portrayed in the fictional story and the last category; setting is related to where the story takes place. It also includes the time frame in which events take place, which could include socio-political and ideological context, as well as the physical location(s) of the action (ibid., pg. 13). She also states that these categories may overlap because they can be interpreted from multiple angles. The interpretive category; which Perdikaki (2018) developed later on for the aims of supporting the descriptive tool and emphasizing the importance of patronage, will not be explained here, since it will not be used in this study. As mentioned above, although this methodical tool
is developed for examining the adaptation shifts of film adaptations mostly, because of its intersemiotic and audiovisual nature, it is assumed that it could operate on videogame adaptations as well. The next section will try to present some information related to the novel Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland and the videogame version, Alice: Madness Returns. After that, an evaluation of descriptive adaptation shifts will be provided regarding the aforementioned products.

3. Adaptation shifts in Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland and Alice: Madness Returns

3.1. Lewis Carroll’s Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland and Alice: Madness Returns

Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland (English original name: Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland) is a fantasy novel published in 1865 by Charles Lutwidge Dodgson, using the pseudonym Lewis Carroll. Through these stories, he reveals how absurd the adult world looks from the eyes of a pure, clean child. Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland is considered one of the best-known classics of world children's literature. However, it has also been evaluated as a fantasy, novel, play, or epic poem that appeals not only to children but also to adults - an allegory that satirized the political and religious strife of the Victorian era was also seen as a symbolism. It is thought that Dodgson, who is a mathematician and a friend of Henry Liddell, the dean of the school he works at, wrote the story that Henry Liddell told his children, Alice and Edith Liddell, at a picnic in 1862, upon the insistence of Alice, and thus the work emerged. But it is said that he insistedly denied that his inspiration was a real child. The story was published as a book in 1865 and was a phenomenal success. The first manuscript dated 1864 was called Alice’s Adventures Under Ground. When Dodgson was encouraged by his friends to publish the manuscript, he made some changes to the story and removed some of the family references for the amusement of the Liddell children. The story was published in 1865 under the new title; Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland (Fawcett, 2016). The story was translated into more than 95 languages and has many adaptations including stage and screen adaptations, radio shows, cartoons, several works of art, ballet shows, and videogames.

The well-known videogame adaptations of the book are American McGee’s Alice (2000) and its sequence Alice: Madness Returns (2011). Both of these games are produced and developed by American James McGee under various-independent game developing companies that McGee has started but function under world-famous EA games and were produced for PC, Xbox, and PlayStation 3. Both of the games have a ‘twisted’ and ‘dark’ theme compared to the original novel and are said to be the “most inspirational, twisting Wonderland” that takes place in Alice’s disturbed head, within her insanity after the tragedy which leaves her without a family. Both of the games featured a high amount of gore and brutality, which was an unusual and contentious element in 2000 but had become a prominent selling point for many commercial action games by the early 2010s. In both cases, the publishing company’s marketing efforts emphasized the games’ dreadful aspect, assuring the players a viscerally exhilarating descent into nightmare landscapes (Follea, 2020, pg.1). When asked the question why he created a dark version of Carroll’s novel, McGee replies that his source of inspiration had always been come from “dark things” such as dark music, dark fiction, and dark movies and that he was always into “stuff that has a dark nature”. He links this to his upbringing, being involved with a religious environment, and how he rebelled against it as a force that has been forced upon him. He states that being rebellious with a darker side is now a part of his personality and this is the way he creates his aesthetics. He also stated in an interview that he intentionally chose Carroll's story to reflect and abuse its “dark narrative pieces” (McGee 2018a, 33:30, cf. Follea, 2020, pg.2).
Alice: Madness Returns (2011) was welcomed by the games with its twisted nature and a different perspective for Carroll’s Wonderland. By Game Rankings and Metacritics, it was ranked approximately 74% for the PC, 73% for the Xbox, and 71% for the PS3 reviews. Alice: Madness Returns (2011) is a follow-up game to the former, American McGee’s Alice, which placed the player in the thoughts of Alice Liddell after she saw the death of her close relatives in a fire that was thought to have been started by her cat, Dinah. The game opens in 1875, around ten years after these tragedies, with Alice imprisoned in the Rutledge Asylum. The purpose of the game was for Alice to battle her way out of her trance like state and back into the working world through levels beginning with Dementia and concluding with Heart of Darkness, when she overcomes the Red Queen and Wonderland may be reconstructed as the location of Alice’s childhood fantasies. In the end, a seemingly cured Alice eventually leaves the asylum, clutching her copy of Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland (Farell, 2015, pg. 42). The given information on American McGee’s Alice’s Adventures intends to connect the two games since they are subsequent ones. The plot of the subject of this article which is Alice: Madness Returns will be presented in detail in the next section where the adaptation shifts will be investigated.

3.2. Analysing the adaptation shifts

The analysis of this study will review the aforementioned game in terms of adaptation shifts proposed by Perdikaki (2017a). The given game will be compared to the original work and it will be analyzed in line with Perdikaki’s descriptive adaptation shifts which are plot structure, narrative techniques, characterization, and setting. In each section, the definitions and subcategories that Perdikaki proposed will be presented and each shift will be analyzed in terms of their subcategories. The analysis of plot structure will present an overview since it is related to the plot of both products and will combine elements from characters and the setting. Furthermore, the narrative techniques will be reviewed and explained in terms of immersive changes that the player experiences throughout the game by using various elements and altering the reality of the player. The characterization analysis, on the other hand, will be based on the differences between the characters, compared to the original work, especially regarding the character transformation of ‘Alice’. Finally, the setting will be reviewed and explained in terms of its spatial and temporal changes.

As it was stated earlier and proposed by Perdikaki (2018), the aforementioned adaptation shifts may overlap and could be interconnected. The adapted version of Carroll’s novel includes many shifts and changes but the main emphasis will be given to the ones which affect the main plot the most, subjectively speaking, and will be in a general sense in terms of the game.

3.2.1. Plot structure

The first two chapters of the book which are “Down the Rabbit Hole” and “Pool of Tears” provide introductory information. In the first chapter, “Down the Rabbit Hole”, we find Alice sitting near her sister, feeling bored and nearly falling into sleep. In this instance, she recognizes a white and clothed rabbit who can talk and owns a pocket watch. She chases the rabbit down to the hole and experiences a very slow fall, which allows her to take a look around and talk to herself- dwelling on thoughts about her cat, Dinah, and trying to use her newly-learned knowledge from school. She finds herself in a corridor, full of locked doors. She finds a little golden key and tries to find the door to which the key belongs. After a while, she finds the little curious door behind a curtain. She manages to open the door and sees a magnificent garden with fountains and flowers but realizes that the door is too small for her to fit in. Later on, she discovers a bottle labeled “DRINK ME” (stylization of the author), drinks it and it causes...
her to shrink but this time she finds herself extremely small to reach the key which she left on the table. While dwelling on deep thoughts and feeling bad about herself, she finds a cake this time- written: “EAT ME”. The events followed by her eating the cake are presented in the second chapter which is “Pool of Tears”. This chapter starts with Alice’s enormous rate of growth. By the time she finishes the cake, she becomes so tall that her head hits the ceiling and she can’t see her feet. Because she is too big and small now, she can’t reach the key again and out of sadness and frustration, she begins to cry. After taking a fan from the white rabbit’s hand, she begins to shrink down but finds herself in a river which was caused by her crying, in her enormous form. While swimming and drifting in her tears, she meets a French rat who is in the water as well and she frightens the mouse because she talks about her cat Dinah and dogs. They find themselves drifting in the water with other animals. The mouse leads them to the shore and they safely land on the shore. The book reveals the adventures that Alice will experience, meeting with different animals like the Caterpillar, the Cheshire Cat- as a guide, the Mock Turtle, the March Hare, and other different characters such as the Hatter, the Queen, and the Duchess. She finds herself in curious situations throughout the book, and at last, she joins a court where she will fight injustice for an instance of pie stealing, she eats one of the cakes from chapter one and grows into enormous size, knocking down the jurors. Despite the events that have taken place, the cold-hearted Queen would like to give a sentence to the Knave who stole the pie, but Alice is ready to fight because now, she will not be afraid of the Queen’s Card Soldiers and she will not back off from any fight because she gained confidence. After this, she finds herself, awakened near her sister on the bank and telling her adventures and leaving her sister to imagine Wonderland and envision what Alice would be like as an adult.

The videogame adaptations seem to only gather the essential plot, characters, and settings and develop a completely different version of Alice Liddell’s life- both in her real life and adventures in Wonderland. While keeping the essentials, McGee, as stated above, creates his version of Alice and her Wonderland with a dark and sinister theme. The first chapter of the videogame version, *Alice: Madness Returns* is combining the two chapters of the story and adapt the general sense of some of the imagery from the book. Although there is no clear and subsequent structuring of these chapters, the combination of different elements contributes to the overall plot. The first chapter of the game is presented as “Pool of Tears” which is the second chapter of the book. The introductory part of the game, on the other hand, is presented with different imagery that is taken from the first game; American McGee’s Alice. The sequel takes place a year after the events of the first game. Alice is presented as a 19-year-old woman who is unable to forget her childhood, which was spent in a world of physical, emotional, and, most importantly, psychological abuse. *Madness Returns* begins with her being in a psychiatrist appointment, during a psychotherapy treatment- hypnosis- attempting to get her head back together following the tragic events of the last game. The initial imagery in the game is a ticking pocket clock and a swinging key, both of which represent the hypnosis therapy she is receiving (Farell, 2015, pg.43). At the same time, this imagery can be considered a common point with the original story and the first chapter where we see Alice following the white rabbit with a pocket watch and pursuing the key to enter the amazing garden that she discovers in the hallways of the rabbit hole. Dr. Bumby, Alice’s therapist in the game, encourages her to forget about her family’s loss and travel to Wonderland, and more keys emerge from the darkness as they speak, until we see Alice with her white rabbit toy, as a child. Alice, after she has grown up and got out of the Asylum, now stays with Dr.Bumby and works for him in an orphanage-running some errands and taking care of the children in the orphanage. After the introductory chapter of the game and the hypnotic treatment is over, Dr.Bumby sends Alice to fetch some drugs, and the heroine is seen in the dark, gloomy streets of 19th century London. Here, she follows a white cat – instead of a white rabbit- and finds herself being face to face with some monster-like characters in a back alley that will be revealed later on will be shaped by Nurse Witless- a woman who is blackmailing
her for her statement about killing her parents with the fire on purpose. At that moment her reality begins to crumble and she finds herself in Wonderland, experiencing a swift fall the Cheshire cat immediately reveals himself to her as a wisdom guide; guiding her throughout the adventures in Wonderland, unlike the original story where the Cheshire cat comes in later chapters. The first chapter begins with her downfall to Wonderland, which functions as a tutorial where she learns to fight, collect items for recollection of her memory, and collect weapons for close combats. The player also is thought how to move around the Wonderland; such as learning how to shrink and grow back, how to float in the air, and how to use weapons. Throughout the gameplay, the player sees the elements of shrinking or growing as a talent – unlike the story the shrinking potion is in a form of a waterfall in the garden she fell in the first place in the game and can use this ability throughout the game. Also, the little potion jars are in the form of solid crystals which the player tries to collect and recollect the memories of her past life and this is one of the essential aims of the gameplay. Also, unlike the original work, the videogame has six chapters in total and many subtitles which set the scene and focus on an element that the original story has (Fawcett, 2016, pg.506). Integration of different chapters from the book and different characters with rather disrupted shapes and forms convey the original work but they are not used as means of full fidelity and can be considered acceptable since “the newly established adaptation studies is getting away from the fidelity based, the normative discourse of its own” (Catrysse, 2014, pg.18). The figures of Hatter, Jabberwocky, and the Caterpillar are thought to be familiar to the player since it is not the first time that Alice comes into Wonderland, which emphasizes the sequel nature of Alice: Madness Returns. So, it can be said that, from a content and plot point of view, the syntax and characters of the original story are used more as a source of inspiration (Baydaş Sayılgan, 2012, pg.128). The overall plot has been disjointed by McGee, changing the narrative by adding different and essential characters such as Dr. Bumby, Nurse Witless, and Mr. Radcliffe who indicate the causes of Alice’s traumatic past and help the player to understand her background.

According to Perdikaki (2017a), the modulation shifts in plot structure can be represented in two ways: by amplification or simplification. While amplification refers to highlighting an event compared to the source text, simplification refers to softening of an event. In the light of both plot structures that are presented above it can be concluded that in terms of Perdikaki’s (2017a) analysis, modifications have been made with different additions and only getting the essential parts of the original plot and the characters, the modifications have affected the overall plot in terms of the major events (pg.14). Also, the additions may have caused a mutation in the plot structure as well (ibid.). Therefore, it can be said that the modulations that have been presented in the plot structure tend to have an addictive nature, which results in amplification in terms of adaptation shifts.

### 3.2.2 Narrative techniques

Perdikaki (2017a) states that narrative techniques are in a complementary tone, which refers to the “way that events of the fictional story are communicated” (pg.14). She further divides this category into two categories as a temporal sequence; i.e., the narrative time of the story, and presentation; i.e., the means of communicating the story (ibid.). The temporal sequence is especially related to the “manipulation of the duration” of the event (ibid.). In the case of Alice: Madness Returns and Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland the duration of the down falling can be considered manipulated. Since the falling into the rabbit hall is communicated as a long-term event in the original work and the following events proceed in a relatively slow way; for example, the events do not begin directly in the rabbit hole, Alice does not realize that she is in the Wonderland from the start but, the game starts with the so-called “falling” process with the following of the white cat, ending up in a back alley and after having a conversation
with Nurse Witless, cracking up of the floor and having a quick fall down to the Wonderland immediately and the heroine begins to follow the quests right after the falling. Perdikaki states that these shifts may affect the experience of the audience in terms of the communication of the story (2017a, pg.15). An instance can be given for Alice: Madness Returns in the case where the player finds himself in a constant state of going back and forward in the reality and imaginary world. While roaming around Wonderland, with the awakening of the heroine, the player can find itself back in the gloomy atmosphere of 19th century London. This replacement traffic affects the overall story, of course, to reveal her past and reconnect her story. The shift of presentation, on the other hand, may be related to the representation of the narration, whether it is represented by a verbal like it does in the source text or as a visual one (ibid.). What is preeminent here is that the monstration; i.e., the formation of visuals is essential in the cinematic mode. According to her, it is important how these representations affect the audience’s meaning-making processes in the adaptation (ibid.). Both cases of modulation and modification can be seen in the adapted version of Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland. Modulation refers to the events that begin told by the narration in third or first-person and/or conveyed through dialogue, and the big part of events is transferred through narration. In Alice: Madness Returns, the player is integrated into the events through monologues and dialogues which are supported by subtitles as well. Although the exact wording is not used, the essence of the plot and characters are conveyed through the narration, in line with the twisted theme and nature of the game. Also, Perdikaki states that soundtracks may affect the communication of adaptations. In the case of this game, soundtracks are used to support the sinister and dark theme of the game, adding thrilling and dangerous elements. In addition, these soundtracks are also supported by the sound effects of the game, which influence the gameplay. The modification, on the other hand, reflects the communication through visual representation. In the game, the events that are narrated are visualized as well, since the game has a considerable number of cinematic scenes, in which the player witnesses the traumatic background of Alice, through the recollection of her memories.

### 3.2.3. Characterization

According to Perdikaki (2017a), shifts in plot structure can be closely related to the ones in characterization, and although all subcategories can be interconnected, the relation between characterization and plot structure may be more evident compared to others.

Although there are immersions of characters that are not present in the book such as Dr. Bumby and Nurse Witless, in Alice: Madness Returns, Alice encounters key figures of Wonderland of Carroll’s original story such as the Mad Hatter, the March Hare, the Carpenter, the Caterpillar, the Red Queen and the Cheshire cat (Fawcett, 2016, pg. 493). In this sense, it can be said that both modulation and mutation exist in videogame adaptation. Mutation derives from the addition of different characters the adaptation is important in terms of the plot but the major shift can be observed in terms of the modification and modulation. According to Perdikaki (2017a, pg. 17), mutation may occur when character representations are emphasized and played down. Modifications, on the other hand, can be related to character constructions. Both of these shifts can be observed in the character of Alice. The character of Alice goes through a transformation compared to the book. The character of Alice is a nine-year-old little girl that tries to abide by the rules of the Victorian age or breaks them by mistake whereas in the videogame version Alice becomes a 19-year-old teenage girl. In Kerchy’s words, there is a transaction “from passive good girl to aggressively confident action heroine” (Kerchy, 2016, pg. 116 cf. Follea, 2020, pg. 3). Although Alice suffers from shame (for killing her family), violent events (abusive behaviors from newly added characters), and hallucinations, she confronts her demons with abandon and perseverance, finally overcoming her trauma. Therefore, McGee’s narrative advancement also
includes narratives of socio-cultural progress, in the sense that they are guided by a reformist twenty-
first-century ideology: the story of Alice’s psychological emancipation is also an “empowerment fantasy,”
which is familiar for many adaptations (ibid., pg.4) – to keep up with the ideological perspectives of the
modern world thus infusing the character with the “21st-century ideology” (Manning, 2011, pg. 171 cf.
ibid.). Also, according to the art director of the game Ken Wong, this heroine draws a different
framework in the way that she is “not framed in a relationship with a male, she’s not the sidekick of a
male, she’s not a daughter, she’s not the love interest. She’s her person” (Harris, 2013 cf. ibid, pg.5).
Thus, it can be concluded that through the videogame adaptation the portrayal of Alice as a strong and
self-sufficient young woman can be considered revolutionary because it “permits the heroine to move
away from the traditional conceptions of being a female that governed nineteenth-century society while
also resisting those that exist in the present” (ibid.).

3.2.4. Setting

Perdikaki (2017a, pg.18) analyses setting shifts under two subcategories namely spatial and temporal.
According to her setting shifts can be emphasized or trivialized in adaptations. In terms of the videogame
and original work, shifts can be observed in both levels. Spatially speaking, in both original work and
videogame adaptation the events take place in 19th century London, in the Victorian age. An important
point can be demonstrated here as such: The player controls Alice through the dark and gloomy streets
of London but she does not have significant power. She does not fight and use her weapons and the
player can only observe her interactions with other characters thus the player has no effect on her
decisions; she has no power in the real world. In Wonderland, on the other hand, which transforms into
‘Londerland’ towards the end of the game to emphasize the interconnectedness between the real and
imaginary worlds, the player gains power through the heroine – altering her choices and fighting with
her enemies. Also, the constant alteration between the real and imagery world is presented to the player
at unexpected times thus causing a modification because, in the original work, the reader finds itself
constantly in Wonderland whereas in the game the realities of the player change, as so Alice’s. There is
a modification in terms of temporality, too. The book emphasizes Alice’s birthday which is on May 4th,
1865 whereas the videogame does not have a special emphasis on that note, it only starts with Alice’s
memories related to the fire and Wonderland and takes place in 1875, since in the game Alice is
transformed into a 19-year-old teenaged girl.

From the analysis above, it can be concluded that descriptive adaptation shifts are observable in terms
of plot structure, narrative techniques, characterization, and setting. In all of these categories,
modulations and modifications are observed to be present and these seem to affect the overall nature of
the game, which can be considered indicators of adaptation shifts. The amplification in the plot
structure, the monstration in the narration; supported with paratextual elements such as soundtracks
and sound effects, the modifications which take place in characterizations with mutations and
modulations and the modifications in temporal and spatial settings all contribute to the dark and sinister
tone of both Alice and Wonderland in McGee’s version; differentiating them from the source text and
allowing Alice, as a character, to evolve.

4. Conclusion

As it is stated above, although Perdikaki’s model was constituted for film adaptations, she proposed the
application of her model to different mediums and genres to see its operation. Drawing upon this
suggestion, this study aimed to reveal the adaptation shifts that occurred between the novel Alice’s
Adventures in Wonderland and the videogame adaptation Alice: Madness Returns by investigating narrative components such as plot structure, narration styles, characterization, and setting.

In line with Perdikaki’s proposition of applying this model to different genres and adaptation types to see the applicability of the model to a broader corpus (2017, pg.20), this particular study concluded that the adaptation shifts could be applied to videogames, which is considered as an intersemiotic multidimensional text. Also, it was concluded that both obligatory and optional shifts occurred. Obligatory shifts have occurred because of the differences between codes, i.e. book to a videogame, and optional changes have occurred since the adapter, McGee for this specific case has altered the original material in accordance with his subjectivity.

4.1. Shifts in plot structure

In terms of the results, it was concluded that plot structure, which can be closely related to characterization shifts, seemed to be shifted towards an eclectic mode since it caused modifications and modulations through the addition of different elements such as the expansion of the story through a sequel game; altering the original version of the story with a darker and more twisted version.

4.2. Shifts in narration style

The narration style, on the other hand, which is closely related to the setting, was shifted with modulations and modifications through the change of point of view and immersion of the player into the gameplay through “being Alice” and observing 19th century London and McGee’s version of Wonderland. With the support of dialogues and narration from different characters such as the Cheshire Cat and Alice herself with her internal conflicts and guidance, the player can experience Alice’s world from a different perspective when compared to Carroll’s Wonderland.

4.3. Shifts in characterizations

The shifts in characterizations are concretely observable since there is the addition of characters as well as usage of the original ones from the original version. Immersion of different characters caused shifts since it has affected the overall plot and storyline and it has moved the original story in a different direction which is a more sinister version of Carroll’s original work.

4.4. Shifts in setting

The setting has observable shifts on both spatial and temporal levels. Modifications have been made to create the different realities that Alice experiences. Although both original and videogame versions take place in 19th century London, the age difference that is represented with the videogame allows players to experience McGee’s Wonderland from the perspective of a 19-year-old teenage girl, who has struggled with traumas and fights for her freedom throughout the game.

4.4. Shifts in reality: reader vs. videogame player

In addition, the constant alterations that occur between Wonderland and the real world transform the videogame to a different level since it moves the player to an unstable understanding of reality in contrast to the original work where the reader experiences Alice’s adventures throughout most of the book.
As it can be seen above, the descriptive videogame adaptation shifts are visible as much as they are in film adaptations although videogames are considered a different medium or product.

For further studies, in addition to widening the corpus to other genres and mediums different from films, these adaptations can help Perdikaki’s (2017a) model to be reinforced. Also, the evaluation of adaptation shifts with both interpretive and descriptive aspects would be beneficial for further applications of Perdikaki’s (2017a) model in different types of videogames. Furthermore, in line with a sociological point of view, the habitus of the game developer can be investigated to reveal the reasons behind the shifts; with the support of the interpretive aspect.

References


Investigating adaptation shifts: Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland vs. Alice: Madness Returns / T. Önenç


Adaptasyon kaymaları üzerine karşılaştırmalı bir çalışma: *Alice Harikalar Diyarında* romanı ve *Alice: Madness Returns* video oyunu / T. Önenç

